COMPREHENSION SHOULDN’T BE SILENT
FROM STRATEGY INSTRUCTION TO STUDENT INDEPENDENCE

Michelle J. Kelley & Nicki Clausen-Grace
CONTENTS

ABOUT THE AUTHORS viii

PREFACE x

What’s New in the Second Edition x
Organization of the Second Edition xi
Acknowledgments xiii

PART I
The Metacognitive Teaching Framework in Your Classroom 1

CHAPTER 1
Introducing the Metacognitive Teaching Framework 3

Assessing Metacognitive Awareness 4
Successful Metacognitive Teaching Practices 5
An Overview of the MTF 5
How the MTF Differs From Other Reading Comprehension Models 7
How the MTF Fits With the CCSS 8
Developing a Common Language 8
Digging Deeper Into the MTF 15
Benefits of Using the MTF 19
The Importance of the Classroom Environment 20

CHAPTER 2
Laying the Foundation for the Metacognitive Teaching Framework 26

Planning for Instruction 27
Introductory Unit: A Week-by-Week Guide to Establishing the MTF 32
Part II
Digging Deeper in Book Clubs

CHAPTER 3
Cultivating Conversations: Student-Led Book Clubs

How Discussion Fits Into the Metacognitive Teaching Framework 61
Teaching Students to Discuss Effectively 62
What Are Student-Led Book Clubs? 63
How Do Student-Led Book Clubs Fit Into the MTF? 69
Assessment: Pros, Cons, Suggestions 78

CHAPTER 4
Promoting Engagement in Reading Through R⁵

The Importance of Independent Reading in Classrooms 82
Effective Independent Reading Programs 83
How Does R⁵ Fit Into Today’s Classrooms? 85
The Nuts and Bolts of R⁵ 86
Read and Relax 87
Reflect and Respond 95
Rap 96
What Has R⁵ Meant to Our Fake Readers? 100

Part III
Metacognitive Strategy Units

CHAPTER 5
Predicting

The Importance of Predicting 108
Problems With Teaching Predicting 109
How and When We Predict 109
How We Predict and the Predicting Components 110
Predicting and the MTF 110
Explicit Instruction of Predicting 111
Refining Strategy Use: Activities for Teaching Predicting 115
  Anticipation Guides 116
  Noticing Text Features 116
CHAPTER 6
Making Connections

137

The Importance of Making Connections 138
Problems With Teaching Connecting 139
How We Connect and the Making Connections Components 139
Making Connections and the Metacognitive Teaching Framework 140
Explicit Instruction of Making Connections 141
Refining Strategy Use: Activities for Teaching Connecting 143
Connections Continuum 144
Venn Diagram and Rubric 146
Compare and Contrast Cinderella Stories 147
Making Meaningful Connections 148
Self-Assessment and Goal Setting 154

CHAPTER 7
Questioning

157

The Importance of Questioning 157
Problems With Teaching Questioning 158
How We Question and the Questioning Components 159
Questioning and the Metacognitive Teaching Framework 159
Explicit Instruction of Questioning 160
Refining Strategy Use: Activities for Teaching Questioning 161
Generating Generic Questions 162
Categorizing Questions 162
Categorizing Students’ Questions 163
Questioning My Text Feature 164
Using Text Features to Question 164
Questioning My Textbook 166
Self-Assessment and Goal Setting 171
CHAPTER 8
Visualizing
174

The Importance of Visualizing  175
Problems With Teaching Visualizing  175
How We Visualize and the Visualizing Components  176
Visualizing and the Metacognitive Teaching Framework  177
Explicit Instruction of Visualizing  177
Refining Strategy Use: Activities for Teaching Visualizing  180
  Visualizing During Shared Reading  180
  Sharing Visualizations in Think-Pair-Share  180
  Rate My Visualization  181
  Making Meaningful Visualizations  181
  Visualization Continuum  182
  Anticipation Guides Extension  183
  Guided-Reading Lesson  183
  Show Me  185
  Character Quilt  186
  Interactive Character Poster  186
  Using a Picture Book With a Strong Character  187
  Visual Timeline  189
  Draw to Remember Events  190
  Scene It!  190
  Setting Quilt  190
  Draw to Remember the Setting  191
  Virtual Setting  192
  Common Senses Lesson 1  194
  Common Senses Lesson 2  194
  Common Senses Lesson 3  194
  Mini Text Set  197
  Draw to Remember Summaries  198
  Sketch to Stretch  199
  Let Me Show You  200

Self-Assessment and Goal Setting  200

CHAPTER 9
Summarizing
202

The Importance of Summarizing  203
Problems With Student Summaries  203
How We Summarize and the Summarizing Components  204
Summarizing and the Metacognitive Teaching Framework  206
Explicit Instruction of Summarizing  206
Refining Strategy Use: Activities for Teaching Summarizing  209
  Summarizing Rubric  209
  Concept–Definition Sort  210
EPILOGUE

APPENDIX A

Matrix of Activities for Teaching Metacognitive Strategies

APPENDIX B

Reproducible Forms, Templates, Rubrics, and Think Sheets on the CD

REFERENCES

LITERATURE CITED

INDEX
M ichelle J. Kelley is an associate professor in reading at the University of Central Florida in Orlando, Florida, USA, where she teaches preservice teachers and graduate students in the Teaching and Learning Principles Department. Her role also includes mentoring and providing professional development to educators. Last year, she was a Professor in Residence at Carillon Elementary School in Oviedo, Florida, where she taught most of her university classes. She’s also in charge of the on-campus Summer Reading Clinic.

Michelle’s teaching career began in West Gardiner, Maine, USA, where she completed her MA in Literacy Education from the University of Southern Maine in Portland while teaching fifth graders. She later moved to Central Florida, where she taught for nine years before becoming a literacy specialist for the intermediate grades. Upon receiving her EdD in educational leadership from the University of Florida in Gainesville, Michelle worked for the Florida Literacy and Reading Excellence Center as a professional developer.

Michelle has worked extensively in urban and suburban schools. Her research area is comprehension, and she has devoted a great deal of time to the role of independent reading in terms of engagement, motivation, self-efficacy, and metacognition. Her articles have appeared in *The Reading Teacher, Voices From the Middle*, and other notable journals. She has authored several children’s books, been recognized with several Disney Teacherrific awards, and received numerous grants to facilitate literacy. Michelle is actively involved in several literacy-related service organizations. Currently, she’s a co-editor of *Literacy Research and Instruction*, a journal published by the Association of Literacy Educators and Researchers.

Michelle lives in Florida with her husband, Shaun, also an educator. They have two children, Tyler and Heather. Michelle enjoys crossword puzzles, reading, traveling, and cooking. She can be reached at michelle.kelley@ucf.edu.

N icks Clausen-Grace is a teacher, author, consultant, and staff developer. She teaches fourth grade at Carillon Elementary School in Oviedo, Florida, USA. As a consultant, she speaks on a variety of literacy topics, including reading engagement, content area reading, literature/textbook circles, word study, and comprehension strategies.

Born and raised in Missouri, Nicki earned her undergraduate degree in elementary education from the University of South Florida in Tampa and her master’s in elementary education from the Lockheed Martin/UCF Academy of Science and Math at the University of Central Florida in Orlando. She has won numerous Disney Innovative Teaching Practices and Teacherrific awards, and she attained National Board Certification as a Middle Childhood Generalist in 1999.

Nicki lives in Florida with her husband, Jeff, also a teacher. They have two children, Brad and Alexandra. When she isn’t working, Nicki likes to bike, boat, cook, read, and spend time outdoors with her family. She can be reached at njgrace@bellsouth.net.
When we first began our work together, the Common Core State Standards didn’t exist. Like many of you, we were concerned about what we perceived as the shallow treatment of reading comprehension. Teachers moved rotely through basal series, following an instructional pattern that was predictable but had little to do with reading deeply. Many times, it went something like this:

*Monday*: Introduce the vocabulary.
*Tuesday*: Students read the story independently.
*Wednesday*: Students read the same story aloud.
*Thursday*: Students listen to the text on tape.
*Friday*: Students take the comprehension test and possibly do a related activity as culmination.

Students began to see reading as little more than following this pattern and answering the questions correctly at the end. Independent reading time was more about the teacher getting caught up on grading papers or taking a few minutes to read various materials than about students practicing reading strategies with support. Reading conferences were often focused on early reading, and intermediate reading sessions lacked substance. We knew we had to do better if we were going to purposefully move our students toward true reading comprehension. This desire and curiosity brought us together and began our journey into metacognition.

Fortunately, our intermediate-age students are usually on their way to becoming readers when we get them, and many are fluent. Unfortunately, many come with a view of reading as a purely mechanical act, something they only do at school. These students can read most of the words on a page, but they haven’t yet learned how reading can help them lead a richer, more meaningful life. They haven’t yet escaped into a text. Moreover, just as important, many students don’t know how to repair meaning when it breaks down.

Our task is to help all of these readers, whatever their strengths and needs are, gain a deeper understanding of what they read. We must indoctrinate them into the world of thoughtful literacy. To do this, we may still need to work on the mechanics of reading with some and stimulate a motivation to read in others. But to improve comprehension, all readers will need the intricate act of making meaning to be broken down into smaller, more explicit steps.

**What’s New in the Second Edition**

We came together in December of 2003 as teacher researchers looking to answer some questions about reading engagement and metacognition. Nicki, then a third-grade teacher, and Michelle, an assistant professor, collaborated on some key issues in Nicki’s
class. We wanted to know how to purposefully move all students toward deeper comprehension and knew that reading engagement was a critical piece of the puzzle. The Metacognitive Teaching Framework (MTF), elaborated in the first edition of this book, was the result of our collaboration.

Since then, many things in education have changed. Whereas students used to come to us with very little reading strategy knowledge, now they almost always have some background in strategy use. Whereas standardized testing used to be considered one measure of a student’s learning, it’s now considered by policymakers as the definitive measure of students’ learning gains and a bellwether of teacher proficiency. Teacher evaluation systems have been redefined, causing teachers to mine through a variety of concepts: “value-added,” scales versus rubrics, and goals versus objectives. The nationwide effort to adopt and implement the Common Core State Standards (CCSS; National Governors Association Center for Best Practices & Council of Chief State School Officers [NGACBP & CCSSO], 2010a) has caused a major shift in teaching. Terminology such as unpacking the Standards, text complexity, and close reading dominates teacher lounges and staff meetings.

We’ve also stepped more firmly into the 21st century. Many classrooms now have access to interactive whiteboards, tablets, and laptops. Combined with the explosion of free interactive applications and user-friendly programs, these technologies have invigorated teaching and learning. Of course, we’re also beginning to teach a generation of students who’ve grown up with a smartphone glued to their hands. We’re challenged to engage students who are used to constant, responsive technology.

Like you, we’ve navigated our way through all of these changes to the best of our abilities. As we addressed each new challenge, we reflected on our use of the MTF and realized that not only is it still valid, but it also helps us meet these challenges head-on. This thought process has helped us strengthen our model to support teachers as they seek to develop thoughtful, successful readers. This second edition is the product of seven years of implementation, reflection, and discussions with other teachers who use the MTF on a daily basis.

In this new edition, we’ve revised our work in the following ways:

- Explicit connections to the CCSS
- New rubrics and scales that are useful to both teachers and students for each of the strategies
- Updates to all chapters based on years of implementation and feedback
- New activities, assessment options, and centers in each of the strategy chapters
- New options for using technology resources with many activities
- Suggestions and resources for using this book with preservice teachers, in a lesson study group, or for professional development

**Organization of the Second Edition**

This book supports many of the professional resources available on teaching strategies. Where it differs, however, is the level of specificity it offers teachers and students. The
MTF, including strategy components, self-assessment and goal-setting plans, and R⁵ (our independent reading structure Read, Relax, Reflect, Respond, and Rap), can be used to help your students take what they learn in strategy lessons to the highest level of integration: independent use. If you haven’t yet used strategy units, this book supplies a basis for doing so. They work especially well when you integrate reading with content area studies, which results in a deeper understanding of both content and reading strategies.

This book is divided into three parts. Part I provides an overview of the MTF. In Chapter 1, we share our rationale for explicitly teaching reading strategies to develop metacognitive readers. We also provide brief definitions of terms, concepts, and structures that appear throughout the book. Then, we outline the MTF used to teach each strategy, including how to create an environment that nurtures metacognition. In Chapter 2, we help you get started by sharing daily, weekly, and yearly plans for implementation, including explicit lessons for success. Part II contains a more in-depth description of how we nurture and promote conversations about texts. Chapter 3 explains the use of book clubs, textbook circles, and other structures to promote discussion, and Chapter 4 provides a detailed look at R⁵. Part III, Chapters 5–9, describes the strategy units that you can use to make each strategy more accessible to students. It includes CCSS-aligned activities to engage students with and reinforce strategy component use.

Additionally, scales, rubrics, and self-assessment and goal-setting plans are offered for each strategy. Throughout the book, you’ll examine classroom transcripts, view student samples, and read teacher transcripts to help clarify key points. Think and Discuss prompts appear throughout, as well as some professional learning activities, to deepen preservice and inservice teachers’ personal learning. The Table of Contents includes each chapter’s major section titles as well as specific lesson titles, listed in order so you can access them quickly and efficiently. The matrix in Appendix A will help you identify activities for teaching metacognitive strategies, and Appendix B lists the numerous reproducibles on the CD that’s included with this book to help you put the strategies to use right away.

As we developed the MTF, we were highly influenced by the work of Keene and Zimmermann (1997) in Mosaic of Thought: Teaching Comprehension in a Reader’s Workshop. And as we read Tovani’s (2000) I Read, but I Don’t Get It: Comprehension Strategies for Adolescent Readers and Miller’s (2002) Reading With Meaning: Teaching Comprehension in the Primary Grades, we were compelled to look deeper at our own comprehension process. Daniels’s (2002) Literature Circles: Voice and Choice in Book Clubs and Reading Groups guided us in our evolution from literature circles to book clubs and as we developed textbook circles to help our students engage more with the content. With a foundation of these inspirational books and now years of implementation, we’ve continued to adjust our instruction to make strategy use more explicit and accessible to our students.

Although the MTF methods were used by the authors in third- and fourth-grade classes, many primary, middle, and high school teachers have adapted the framework with a high degree of success. For example, some early primary teachers have created anchor charts with just a couple of the components for a strategy they’re teaching. Until kids can read on their own, strategy lessons are used with read-alouds.
This book is the chronicle of our journey toward a classroom in which every student thinks deeply and purposefully about what and how he or she is reading. It explains how to empower kids with the language and skills to make their thinking visible—and ultimately improve their reading comprehension and engagement. We hope that what we’ve presented in this book makes as much of a difference in the reading lives of you and your students as it has in ours.

Acknowledgments

Our journey has resulted in tremendous professional growth for both of us. We could not have traveled this path without Nicki’s students and feedback from other teachers who use the MTF. They helped us develop and evolve the framework into its current format. We’d like to thank Katy Hanbury for her original transcription, Gretchen Flynn of Flynn Photography for her wonderful images, and Joy Tappen for helping Nicki’s students create the beautiful quilt featured on the back cover and the flags on the front cover.

We also owe thanks to our families, who’ve been flexible as our work took us across the country and caused us to be tied to our respective computers on numerous vacations. Our husbands, Shaun and Jeff, have become good friends, perhaps out of survival (or not), and have been supportive and lighthearted throughout our partnership.

Thanks also to our editors, Tori Mello Bachman and Susanne Viscarra. Tori’s ongoing support of our work and her well-informed insight has helped us build on our original work, and Susanne’s attention to detail truly helped us communicate the way we intended. Without her, our manuscript wouldn’t have been as comprehensible and consistent.